A Container Model of Type Theory

Stefania Damato j.w.w. Thorsten Altenkirch

University of Nottingham, UK

YaMCATS Meeting 32

14th September 2023

Motivation:

modelling inductive types

data \mathbb{N} : Set where

 ${\tt zero}$: ${\mathbb N}$

succ : $\mathbb{N} \to \mathbb{N}$

```
data \mathbb{N} : Set where zero : \mathbb{N} succ : \mathbb{N} \to \mathbb{N} zero: \mathbb{N}^1 succ: \mathbb{N}^{\mathbb{N}}
```

```
data \mathbb{N} : Set where zero : \mathbb{N} succ : \mathbb{N} \to \mathbb{N} \downarrow zero : \mathbb{N}^{\mathbb{N}} \downarrow zero × succ : \mathbb{N}^{\mathbb{N}+\mathbb{N}}
```

```
data \mathbb{N} : Set where
     zero : N
     succ : \mathbb{N} \to \mathbb{N}
zero: \mathbb{N}^1
succ: \mathbb{N}^{\mathbb{N}}
\texttt{zero} \times \texttt{succ} : \mathbb{N}^{1+\mathbb{N}}
zero \times succ : 1 + \mathbb{N} \to \mathbb{N}
```

```
data \mathbb{N}: Set where
     zero : N
     succ : \mathbb{N} \to \mathbb{N}
zero: N1
\operatorname{succ} \colon \mathbb{N}^{\mathbb{N}}
zero \times succ : \mathbb{N}^{1+\mathbb{N}}
zero \times succ : 1 + \mathbb{N} \to \mathbb{N}
        F_{\mathbb{N}} : \mathbf{Set} \to \mathbf{Set}
F_{\mathbb{N}}(X) \coloneqq \mathbf{1} + X
```

```
data \mathbb{N} : Set where
                                                             data C : Set where
                                                                       c: ((C \rightarrow 2) \rightarrow 2) \rightarrow C
    zero : N
    succ : \mathbb{N} \to \mathbb{N}
zero: N1
\operatorname{succ} \colon \mathbb{N}^{\mathbb{N}}
zero \times succ : \mathbb{N}^{1+\mathbb{N}}
zero \times succ : 1 + \mathbb{N} \to \mathbb{N}
       F_{\mathbb{N}}: Set \rightarrow Set
F_{\mathbb{N}}(X) := \mathbf{1} + X
```

```
data \mathbb{N}: Set where
                                                                data C : Set where
                                                                         c: ((C \rightarrow 2) \rightarrow 2) \rightarrow C
    zero : ℕ
    succ : \mathbb{N} \to \mathbb{N}
                                                               c: ((C \rightarrow 2) \rightarrow 2) \rightarrow C
zero: N1
\operatorname{succ} \colon \mathbb{N}^{\mathbb{N}}
zero \times succ : \mathbb{N}^{1+\mathbb{N}}
zero \times succ : 1 + \mathbb{N} \to \mathbb{N}
       F_{\mathbb{N}}: Set \rightarrow Set
F_{\mathbb{N}}(X) \coloneqq \mathbf{1} + X
```

```
data \mathbb{N} : Set where
    zero : ℕ
    succ : \mathbb{N} \to \mathbb{N}
zero: N1
\operatorname{succ} \colon \mathbb{N}^{\mathbb{N}}
zero \times succ : \mathbb{N}^{1+\mathbb{N}}
zero \times succ : 1 + \mathbb{N} \to \mathbb{N}
       F_{\mathbb{N}}: Set \rightarrow Set
F_{\mathbb{N}}(X) := \mathbf{1} + X
```

data C : Set where

c :
$$((C \rightarrow 2) \rightarrow 2) \rightarrow C$$
 \downarrow

c: $((C \rightarrow 2) \rightarrow 2) \rightarrow C$
 \downarrow
 F_C : **Set** \rightarrow **Set**
 $F_C(X) := (X \rightarrow 2) \rightarrow 2$

```
data W (S : Set) (P : S \rightarrow Set) : Set where sup : (s : S) \rightarrow (P s \rightarrow W S P) \rightarrow W S P
```

```
data W (S : Set) (P : S \rightarrow Set) : Set where sup : (s : S) \rightarrow (P s \rightarrow W S P) \rightarrow W S P
```

N as a W-type

data \mathbb{N} : Set where

 $zero: \mathbb{N}$

succ : $\mathbb{N} \to \mathbb{N}$

```
data W (S : Set) (P : S \rightarrow Set) : Set where sup : (s : S) \rightarrow (P s \rightarrow W S P) \rightarrow W S P
```

N as a W-type

data \mathbb{N} : Set where

S := 1 + 1

zero : N

 $succ : \mathbb{N} \to \mathbb{N}$

```
data W (S : Set) (P : S \rightarrow Set) : Set where sup : (s : S) \rightarrow (P s \rightarrow W S P) \rightarrow W S P
```

N as a W-type

data \mathbb{N} : Set where S := 1 + 1

zero : №

 $\operatorname{succ} : \mathbb{N} \to \mathbb{N} \qquad \qquad \operatorname{P}(\operatorname{inl} \star) \coloneqq \mathbf{0}$

 $P(inr \star) := 1$

```
data W (S : Set) (P : S \rightarrow Set) : Set where sup : (s : S) \rightarrow (P s \rightarrow W S P) \rightarrow W S P
```

N as a W-type

data \mathbb{N} : Set where S := 1 + 1

zero : N

 $\operatorname{succ} : \mathbb{N} \to \mathbb{N} \qquad \qquad \operatorname{P}(\operatorname{inl} \star) \coloneqq \mathbf{0}$

 $P(inr \star) := 1$

 $\mathbb{N} \cong \mathbb{W} S P$.

```
data W (S : Set) (P : S \rightarrow Set) : Set where sup : (s : S) \rightarrow (P s \rightarrow W S P) \rightarrow W S P
```

```
N as a W-type
```

```
data \mathbb{N} : Set where
                                                                  S := 1 + 1
    zero: N
                                                               P(inl \star) := 0
    succ : \mathbb{N} \to \mathbb{N}
                                                              P(inr \star) := 1
\mathbb{N} \cong \mathbb{W} S P.
  7: WSP
  z := \sup (\operatorname{inl} \star) (\lambda())
  s: WSP \rightarrow WSP
s n := sup (inr \star) (\lambda_-.n)
```

```
data W (S : Set) (P : S \rightarrow Set) : Set where sup : (s : S) \rightarrow (P s \rightarrow W S P) \rightarrow W S P
```

\mathbb{N} as a W-type data \mathbb{N} : Set where S:=1+1 zero: \mathbb{N} succ: $\mathbb{N} \to \mathbb{N}$ $P(\mathsf{inl} \star) := 0$ $P(\mathsf{inr} \star) := 1$ $\mathbb{N} \cong \mathbb{W} SP$.

 $z := \sup (\inf \star) (\lambda())$

 $s n := sup (inr \star) (\lambda_-.n)$

 $s: WSP \rightarrow WSP$

Definition

A *container* is a pair $S : Set, P : S \rightarrow Set$, written as $S \triangleleft P$.

Definition

A container is a pair $S : Set, P : S \rightarrow Set$, written as $S \triangleleft P$.

Definition

Extension functor $[S \triangleleft P]$: **Set** \rightarrow **Set** is defined by

$$\llbracket S \triangleleft P \rrbracket X := \sum (s : S)(Ps \rightarrow X).$$

Definition

A container is a pair $S : Set, P : S \rightarrow Set$, written as $S \triangleleft P$.

Definition

Extension functor $[S \triangleleft P]$: **Set** \rightarrow **Set** is defined by

$$\llbracket S \triangleleft P \rrbracket X := \sum (s : S)(Ps \rightarrow X).$$

N's container representation

$$P(inl \star) := 0$$

$$P(inr \star) := 1$$

$$[S \triangleleft P]: \mathbf{Set} \to \mathbf{Set}$$

$$[S \triangleleft P]X = \sum (s: 1+1)((\lambda (\mathsf{inl} \star).0; (\mathsf{inr} \star).1) \to X)$$

$$\cong 1+X$$

Definition

A *container* is a pair $S : Set, P : S \rightarrow Set$, written as $S \triangleleft P$.

Definition

Extension functor $[S \triangleleft P]$: **Set** \rightarrow **Set** is defined by

$$\llbracket S \triangleleft P \rrbracket X \coloneqq \sum (s : S)(Ps \to X).$$

Containers enforce strict positivity semantically.

An overview of inductive types

Class of types	Functor type	Category theory semantics	Type theoretic normal form	Universal type
ordinary inductive types	$\textbf{Set} \rightarrow \textbf{Set}$	initial algebras of endofunctors on	containers	W-type
e.a. ℕ : Set		Set		

An overview of inductive types

Class of types	Functor type	Category theory semantics	Type theoretic normal form	Universal type
ordinary inductive types e.g. № : Set	$\textbf{Set} \rightarrow \textbf{Set}$	initial algebras of endofunctors on Set	containers	W-type
inductive families e.g. Fin : $\mathbb{N} \to Set$	$(\textbf{I} \rightarrow \textbf{Set}) \rightarrow (\textbf{I} \rightarrow \textbf{Set})$	initial algebras of endofuntors on Set ¹	indexed containers	WI-type

An overview of inductive types

Class of types	Functor type	Category theory semantics	Type theoretic normal form	Universal type
ordinary inductive types $ \text{e.g. } \mathbb{N}: \text{Set} $	$\textbf{Set} \to \textbf{Set}$	initial algebras of endofunctors on Set	containers	W-type
inductive families e.g. Fin : $\mathbb{N} \to Set$	$(\textbf{I} \rightarrow \textbf{Set}) \rightarrow (\textbf{I} \rightarrow \textbf{Set})$	initial algebras of endofuntors on Set ¹	indexed containers	WI-type
QIITs e.g. Con : Set, Ty : Con \rightarrow Set	?	?	?	?

Quotient inductive-inductive types

Quotient inductive-inductive types

Example 1.1: (Simplified) intrinsic syntax of type theory

```
data Con: Set
data Ty : Con → Set
data Con where
      ♦ : Con
      \_,\_: (\Gamma: Con) (A: Ty \Gamma) \rightarrow Con
      eq : (\Gamma : Con) (A : Ty \Gamma) (B : Ty (\Gamma , A)) \rightarrow
              ((\Gamma, A), B) \equiv (\Gamma, \Sigma \Gamma A B)
data Ty where
      \iota : (\Gamma : Con) \rightarrow Ty \Gamma
      \Sigma : (\Gamma : Con) (A : Ty \Gamma) \rightarrow Ty (\Gamma , A) \rightarrow Ty \Gamma
```

Functorial semantics, for QIITs [Altenkirch et al., 2018]

Category A₀ of sorts.

Functorial semantics, for QIITs [Altenkirch et al., 2018]

- Category A₀ of sorts.
- Constructor specification. The nth constructor is specified by two functors

$$L_n \colon \mathbf{A_n} \to \mathbf{Set},$$

 $R_n \colon \int L_n \to \mathbf{Set}.$

Functorial semantics, for QIITs [Altenkirch et al., 2018]

Example 1.1 data Con : Set data Ty : Con \rightarrow Set data Con where \rightarrow : Con $_{--}$: (Γ : Con) (A : Ty Γ) \rightarrow Con eq : (Γ : Con) (A : Ty Γ) \rightarrow Con (Γ , E) \rightarrow E : (Γ : Con) \rightarrow Ty Γ \rightarrow : (Γ : Con) \rightarrow Ty Γ \rightarrow : (Γ : Con) \rightarrow Ty Γ \rightarrow : (Γ : Con) \rightarrow Ty Γ \rightarrow : (Γ : Con) (Λ : Ty Γ) \rightarrow Ty Γ

- Category A₀ of sorts.
- Constructor specification. The nth constructor is specified by two functors

$$L_n \colon \mathbf{A_n} \to \mathbf{Set},$$

 $R_n \colon \int L_n \to \mathbf{Set}.$

③ Category of algebras. A_{n+1} is the category having objects of type $\sum (A : |A_n|)(c : (x : L_n A) \rightarrow R_n(A, x))$.

Containerification

Goal: restrict

$$L_n \colon \mathbf{A_n} \to \mathbf{Set},$$

 $R_n \colon \int L_n \to \mathbf{Set}$

to be container functors (+ other restrictions).

Containerification

Goal: restrict

$$L_n \colon \mathbf{A_n} \to \mathbf{Set},$$

 $R_n \colon \int L_n \to \mathbf{Set}$

to be container functors (+ other restrictions).

Definition

Given category \mathbf{C} , a *generalised container* is a pair S: Set, $P: S \to |\mathbf{C}|$.

The extension functor $[S \triangleleft P]$: $C \rightarrow Set$ is defined by

$$\llbracket S \triangleleft P \rrbracket X := \sum (s : S)(\mathbf{C}(Ps, X)).$$

An overview of inductive types, revisited

Class of types	Representation	Category theory semantics	Type theoretic normal form	Universal type
ordinary inductive types e.g. \mathbb{N} : Set	$\begin{array}{c} \text{functor} \\ \textbf{Set} \rightarrow \textbf{Set} \end{array}$	initial algebras of endofunctors on Set	containers	W-type
inductive families e.g. Fin : $\mathbb{N} \to Set$	$\begin{array}{c} \text{functor} \\ (\textbf{I} \rightarrow \textbf{Set}) \rightarrow (\textbf{I} \rightarrow \textbf{Set}) \end{array}$	initial algebras of endofuntors on Set ¹	indexed containers	WI-type
QIITs e.g. Con : Set, Ty : Con \rightarrow Set	sequence of functors L_n and R_n and sequence of categories of dialgebras	initial object in last constructed category of dialgebras A _n	representations constructed via generalised containers	? (QW-type)

The container model

Categories with families

Definition

A category with families (CwF) consists of:

 A category C, of contexts and context substitutions, having a terminal object.

Categories with families

Definition

A category with families (CwF) consists of:

- A category C, of contexts and context substitutions, having a terminal object.
- A functor Ty: C^{op} → Set.

Categories with families

Definition

A category with families (CwF) consists of:

- A category C, of contexts and context substitutions, having a terminal object.
- A functor Ty: C^{op} → Set.
- A functor $Tm: (\int Ty)^{op} \to \mathbf{Set}$.

Categories with families

Definition

A category with families (CwF) consists of:

- A category C, of contexts and context substitutions, having a terminal object.
- A functor Ty: C^{op} → Set.
- A functor $Tm: (\int Ty)^{op} \to \mathbf{Set}$.
- For every $\Gamma : |\mathbf{C}|$ and $A : Ty(\Gamma)$,
 - an object Γ.A: |C|
 - a morphism $p: \Gamma.A \to \Gamma$ in **C**
 - and a term q : Tm(Γ.A, A[p]),

with a certain universal property.

(-[f] denotes the action of Ty and Tm on a morphism f.)

- Category Con whose
 - objects (contexts) are presheaves $C^{op} \rightarrow Set$

- Category Con whose
 - objects (contexts) are presheaves C^{op} → Set
 - morphisms (substitutions) are natural transformations

- Category Con whose
 - objects (contexts) are presheaves C^{op} → Set
 - morphisms (substitutions) are natural transformations
 - terminal object (empty context) is the constant 1 presheaf.

- Category Con whose
 - objects (contexts) are presheaves C^{op} → Set
 - morphisms (substitutions) are natural transformations
 - terminal object (empty context) is the constant 1 presheaf.
- Types in context Γ are presheaves over $\int \Gamma$.

Ty: Con^{op} → Set
Ty
$$\Gamma := (\int \Gamma)^{op} \to$$
Set

- Category Con whose
 - objects (contexts) are presheaves C^{op} → Set
 - morphisms (substitutions) are natural transformations
 - terminal object (empty context) is the constant 1 presheaf.
- Types in context Γ are presheaves over ∫ Γ.

$$Ty: \mathbf{Con}^{\mathsf{op}} \to \mathbf{Set}$$

 $Ty \, \Gamma := (\int \Gamma)^{\mathsf{op}} \to \mathbf{Set}$

 Terms in context Γ of type A are dependent natural transformations from Γ to A.

$$Tm: (\int Ty)^{op} \to \mathbf{Set}$$

$$Tm(\Gamma, A) := \int_{X:\mathbf{Set}} (\gamma : \Gamma X) \to A(X, \gamma)$$

- Category Con whose
 - objects (contexts) are presheaves C^{op} → Set
 - morphisms (substitutions) are natural transformations
 - terminal object (empty context) is the constant 1 presheaf.
- Types in context Γ are presheaves over ∫ Γ.

$$Ty: \mathbf{Con}^{\mathsf{op}} \to \mathbf{Set}$$

 $Ty \, \Gamma := (\int \Gamma)^{\mathsf{op}} \to \mathbf{Set}$

• Terms in context Γ of type A are dependent natural transformations from Γ to A.

$$Tm: (\int Ty)^{\operatorname{op}} \to \mathbf{Set}$$

$$Tm(\Gamma, A) := \int_{X: \operatorname{Set}} (\gamma : \Gamma X) \to A(X, \gamma)$$

• Context extension $(\Gamma.A) X = \sum (\gamma : \Gamma X) (A(X, \gamma)).$

- Category Con whose
 - objects (contexts) are set-containers S : Set, P: S → Set with extension functor [S ▷ P]: Set → Set

- Category Con whose
 - objects (contexts) are set-containers S : Set, P : S → Set with extension functor [S ▷ P]: Set → Set
 - morphisms (substitutions) are container morphisms

- Category Con whose
 - objects (contexts) are set-containers S : Set, P : S → Set with extension functor [S < P]: Set → Set
 - morphisms (substitutions) are container morphisms
 - terminal object (empty context) is 1

 0.

- Category Con whose
 - objects (contexts) are set-containers S : Set, P : S → Set with extension functor [S ⊲ P]: Set → Set
 - morphisms (substitutions) are container morphisms
 - terminal object (empty context) is 1 < 0.
- ullet Types in context Γ are generalised containers S: Set,

 $P: S \to |\int \llbracket \Gamma \rrbracket| \text{ over } \int \llbracket \Gamma \rrbracket, \text{ with extension functor }$

$$[S \triangleleft P]: (f[\Gamma]) \rightarrow \mathbf{Set}.$$

- Category Con whose
 - objects (contexts) are set-containers S : Set, P : S → Set with extension functor [S ⊲ P]: Set → Set
 - morphisms (substitutions) are container morphisms
 - terminal object (empty context) is 1 < 0.
- Types in context Γ are generalised containers S : Set,
 P: S → | ∫ [Γ] | over ∫ [Γ], with extension functor

$$\llbracket S \triangleleft P \rrbracket : (f \llbracket \Gamma \rrbracket) \rightarrow \mathbf{Set}.$$

 Terms in context Γ of type A are dependent natural transformations from [Γ] to [A].

$$Tm: (\int Ty)^{\operatorname{op}} \to \mathbf{Set}$$

$$Tm(\Gamma, A) := \int_{X: \operatorname{Set}} (\gamma : \llbracket \Gamma \rrbracket X) \to \llbracket A \rrbracket (X, \gamma)$$

- Category Con whose
 - objects (contexts) are set-containers S : Set, P : S → Set with extension functor [[S ▷ P]] : Set → Set
 - morphisms (substitutions) are container morphisms
 - terminal object (empty context) is 1 < 0.
- Types in context Γ are generalised containers S : Set,
 P: S → |∫[[Γ]]| over ∫[[Γ]], with extension functor

$$\llbracket S \triangleleft P \rrbracket : (f \llbracket \Gamma \rrbracket) \rightarrow \mathbf{Set}.$$

 Terms in context Γ of type A are dependent natural transformations from [Γ] to [A].

$$Tm: (\int Ty)^{\operatorname{op}} \to \mathbf{Set}$$

$$Tm(\Gamma, A) := \int_{X:\operatorname{Set}} (\gamma : \llbracket \Gamma \rrbracket X) \to \llbracket A \rrbracket (X, \gamma)$$

Context extension

?
$$(\Gamma.A) X = \sum_{s} (\Gamma.S)(A.SA) \triangleleft \lambda(s\Gamma, sA).(A.PA) s\Gamma sA$$
 ?

Presheaf model & container model

Presheaf model

- Contexts: C^{op} → Set
- Substitutions: natural transformations
- Types: $(\int \Gamma)^{op} \to \mathbf{Set}$
- Terms:

$$\int_{X:\mathsf{Set}} (\gamma : \Gamma X) \to A(X,\gamma)$$

- Contexts: Set → Set
- Substitutions: container morphisms
- Types: (∫[[Γ]]) → Set
- Terms:

$$\int_{X:\mathsf{Set}} (\gamma : \llbracket \Gamma \rrbracket X) \to \llbracket A \rrbracket (X, \gamma)$$

• Deal with coherence issues.

- Deal with coherence issues.
 - Category of set-containers has a groupoid (as opposed to an h-set) of objects.
 - → Add coherences to the CwF.
 - Strictify objects via an inductive-recursive universe:

```
data U : Set where
nat : U
```

```
El : U \rightarrow Set
El nat = \mathbb{N}
```

- Deal with coherence issues.
 - Category of set-containers has a groupoid (as opposed to an h-set) of objects.

 - Strictify objects via an inductive-recursive universe:

```
data U : Set where
  nat : U

El : U → Set
El nat = N
```

• Strictify pullbacks and pushouts (e.g. when proving $A[f \circ g] \equiv A[f][g]$).

- Deal with coherence issues.
 - Category of set-containers has a groupoid (as opposed to an h-set) of objects.

 - Strictify objects via an inductive-recursive universe:

```
data U : Set where
  nat : U

El : U → Set
El nat = N
```

- Strictify pullbacks and pushouts (e.g. when proving $A[f \circ g] \equiv A[f][g]$).
- For QIIT semantics, we need Con to be the category of generalised containers (as opposed to set-containers).

Related work

 Thorsten Altenkirch and Ambrus Kaposi's TYPES abstract 'A container model of type theory'.

Related work

- Thorsten Altenkirch and Ambrus Kaposi's TYPES abstract 'A container model of type theory'.
- Tamara von Glehn's polynomial functor model using comprehension categories.

Related work

- Thorsten Altenkirch and Ambrus Kaposi's TYPES abstract 'A container model of type theory'.
- Tamara von Glehn's polynomial functor model using comprehension categories.
- Bob Atkey and András Kovács's implementation of the same model as a CwF.

Summary

- QIITs combine set-truncated equalities with induction-induction.
- We can represent QIITs semantically as initial objects in a category of algebras.
- Containerification of QIIT semantics requires as a prerequisite the ability to express any statement in type theory as a container. This can be achieved by a container model of type theory.
- The container model is a restricted version of the presheaf model.

Summary

- QIITs combine set-truncated equalities with induction-induction.
- We can represent QIITs semantically as initial objects in a category of algebras.
- Containerification of QIIT semantics requires as a prerequisite the ability to express any statement in type theory as a container. This can be achieved by a container model of type theory.
- The container model is a restricted version of the presheaf model.

Thank you!

References I

- Altenkirch, T., Capriotti, P., Dijkstra, G., Kraus, N., and Nordvall Forsberg, F. (2018).

 Quotient inductive-inductive types.

 In Baier, C. and Dal Lago, U., editors, *FoSSACS*, pages 293–310. Springer.
- Altenkirch, T. and Kaposi, A. (2021). A container model of type theory. In *TYPES 2021*.

0d1f04057939905d35699f1b1c323736.

Interpreting dependent types with containers.

Talk at the MSP101 seminar, University of Strathclyde, slides at https://bentnib.org/docs/tt-in-containers.pdf, code at https://gist.github.com/bobatkey/

Atkey, R. (2020).

References II



Kovács, A. (2020).

Construction of the containers / polynomials cwf in agda.

Code at https://gist.github.com/AndrasKovacs/ cf7cc88f667c8f0087a4981f6be4eef8.



von Glehn, T. (2015).

Polynomials and models of type theory.

PhD thesis, University of Cambridge.